A NEW RECIPE FROM MY FACEBOOK: HOW DIGITAL LITERACY IMPACTING INNOVATION OF SMALL CULINARY ENTERPRISES IN INDONESIA

Angga Prawadika Aji
angga.prawadika@fisip.unair.ac.id
Department of Communication Science, Airlangga University

Article Info

Abstract

This paper is written based on a qualitative approach, to explore the ability to use communication technology by micro, small, and medium enterprises (MSMES) within the culinary field to support their ability to innovate in developing countries such as Indonesia. A total of 30 small and micro enterprises from the two biggest cities in East Java province participated in this empirical study. The data collection system is carried out using a semi-structured interview that looks at the ability of business users to understand the internet as a media through four digital literacy elements, namely the ability to access, analyze, evaluate, and create messages. Based on the results of comparative analysis, it was found that the majority of MSMES owners have just reached the access phase, which is the initial phase where users are connected to the internet and utilize the most basic features of application services. MSMES owners only use internet technology for informal communication purposes and access to entertainment. One of the most important points from the results of the interview is the existence of religious issues which hamper the willingness of some MSMES owners to embrace the internet by creating reluctance and suspicion against the internet. One of them is the usury discourse that appears on non-cash payment technology and food purchasing services by online transportation.

INTRODUCTION

The main objective of this research project is to explore the capabilities of the use of communication technologies by the owner of micro, small, and medium enterprises (MSMES) within the culinary field, in order to support their ability to innovate in developing countries like Indonesia. This study also aims to fill the void of supporting literature on the issue of the use of communication technology in the form of the Internet for small-scale enterprises engaged in the culinary sector, one of the main sectors that hold a key role in the direction of the development of Indonesia's creative economy. Previously, quite a lot of

Corresponding Author:
Department of Communication Science, Airlangga University, Indonesia
Jl. Dharmawangsa Dalam, Surabaya,Jawa Timur

Email: angga.prawadika@fisip.unair.ac.id

research had been carried out on the topic of the use of communication technology (ICT) and its effects on small business innovation (Akkeren and Cavaye 1999; Mutula and Van Brakel 2007; Hashim 2007). However, research that specifically focused on small businesses in the food sector in developing countries such as Indonesia is somewhat lacking. This is important because small businesses in the food sector hold a large portion of the total SME (APF Canada 2018). Food and culinary-based small businesses also have special characteristics that are different compared to other sectors, both in terms of management and development (Najib and Kiminami 2011; Ismail 2014; Abdul et al. 2013; Tambunan 2009. In general, the food and beverage service industry, or culinary business in general, is one of the most important and dominant businesses in the Indonesian business landscape. The culinary business itself experienced quite sharp fluctuations after the Covid-19 pandemic period, which was shown by the economic slowdown which had an impact on the development pattern of the culinary business in Indonesia. The culinary business in Indonesia itself can be divided based on three main categories, namely service type (cafes and bars, cloud kitchens, full-service restaurants, and quick-service restaurants), based on outlet type (chained outlets and independent outlets),

and based on location (leisure, lodging, standalone, and travel). The success of the culinary business in Indonesia cannot be separated from the role of social media. Social media is able to expand promotions and create virality that never appears in other media. Instagram culture, which emphasizes visual displays, also provides a strong impetus for Indonesian people's consumption patterns for culinary products. Social media is also recognized as creating a new channel that makes it easier to communicate, observe, and evaluate business owners regarding customer responses.

Until now, micro, small, and medium enterprises (MSMES) are still the main engines of Indonesia's economic growth. Around 99 % of total businesses in Indonesia are included in MSMES, which practically employs 89 % of the total workforce available in Indonesia and contributes to the acquisition of 60% of the country's GDP (APF Canada 2018). Of all MSMES spread throughout Indonesia, one-third are included in the food and beverage service and food processing sectors. The culinary sector holds a key portion in the "Creative Economic Development Scheme" that has been declared by the Government of Indonesia since 2017. Nearly 42% of the total gross domestic product (GDP) of Indonesia's creative economy is contributed by the

culinary sector (Handayani 2018). This figure occupies the highest point of the 16 sectors developed by the Indonesian Creative Economy Agency (Bekraf). This growth is most visible in the East Java region, where the growth of the culinary and accommodation business increased significantly throughout 2018 (Handayani 2018; Trihendrawan 2019).

Various forms of culinary-based small and medium-sized enterprises are present throughout Indonesia by offering a wide variety of menus. Innovation is the most important element in the food sector to strengthen competitiveness (Grunert et al. 1996). The culinary business is also experiencing a change in trend where the menu offered is now not only limited to general traditional menus but also penetrated rapidly into international menus that are quickly adjusted to the tastes and purchasing power of the Indonesian people. Diversification of culinary products also seems to be developing rapidly. Enterprise owner also implements various business strategy to attract and maintain customers (APF Canada 2018).

The development of information and communication technology (ICT) brings new challenges for MSMES actors. The ability of businesses to adopt and maximize the Internet becomes one of the main factors that determine the sustainability of business,

to seize market opportunities, as well as to ensure superiority against competitors in the current era (Rahayu and Day 2015). Previously, a lot of research has been done that looks at how small and medium businesses react to the use of the internet, including adopting internet technology to maximize competence and maximize e-commerce (Johnson, Edmundson-bird, and Keegan 2015; Mehrtens, Cragg, and Mills 2001; Akkeren and Cavaye 1999; Mutula and Van Brakel 2007; Hashim 2007; Rahayu and Day 2015). Unfortunately, most previous research emphasizes the function of the Internet as a business support tool. Maximizing the use of the internet is essentially related to a set of strategic cognitive abilities that users have when consuming and producing a variety of content and services on the Internet (Osterman 2012; Spires, Paul, and Kerkhoff 2017). The process of understanding the internet itself is a complex combination of understanding and ability that cannot only be seen from the efforts of maximizing one business element but as a holistic interpretation of how to access and maximize all services on the internet (Meyers, Erickson, and Small 2013; Osterman 2012). A process that is now known as digital literacy (Osterman 2012; Johnson, Edmundson-bird, and Keegan 2015; Iqbal et al. 2014; Williams 2015).

Also different from previous research which focus on companies, this research focuses on business owners. This decision is crucial given that at the MSMES level, the owner's role as a decision-maker and determinant of the business direction is very dominant. Focusing research on MSMES owners will help fill the explanation gap in the IT adoption model by providing insights into the relationship between the lack of digital literacy levels and the slow adoption of IT (Hashim 2007).

Although many studies have focused on the theme of using digital media to enhance MSMES innovations, only a few of them have focused on how business actors understand the changing landscape of digital media. One of the biggest challenges in the context of digital media presence is the ability of the public to understand and use all components of digital media appropriately (Webber and Johnston 2000; Eshet-alkalai 2004; Williams 2015). All business sectors, from manufacturing, service, and agriculture, all the way to retail, depend on data and the global flow of information provided by the Internet. The majority of studies on the use of the internet element by MSMES view the internet as a strategic practical element, which although vital in responding to the challenges faced by MSMES, has the potential to neglect the fundamental understanding of the ability of businesses to understand new media ecosystems and all information circulation and interactions within it (Hashim 2007). This emphasis applies doubly in the case of developing countries where the presence of the internet gives significant impacts and patterns that are significantly different from other studies conducted in developed countries (Mutula and Van Brakel 2007). A thorough and critical understanding of this new media, better known as digital literacy, is an important element that must be a concern to support the development process of the small and medium business sector in Indonesia. Based on the description previously explained, this research attempts to look more deeply at the influence that social media has on the development of small and medium businesses in Indonesia through a qualitative study.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Digital Literacy

The concept of digital literacy was initially widely misunderstood as 'digital capabilities' or 'knowledge of operating computers' by the majority of commercial and business parties (Johnson, Edmundson-bird, and Keegan 2015; Williams 2015). This situation is quite reasonable considering the concept of digital literacy has been viewed in various ways by various experts since it was first introduced by Paul Gilster in 1997. However, all

definitions of digital literacy go to the same foundation: the increasing use and recognition of the importance of digital media in all aspects of life (Iqbal et al. 2014; Gilster 1997; Meyers, Erickson, and Small 2013; Eshet-alkalai 2004; Bhatt, Roock, and Adams 2015) which at the same time also encourages the user's ability to access and respond to messages media critically to enhance individual control over the use of digital media. The majority of definitions of digital literacy always contain at least several similar points, including effective information retrieval, valid knowledge of information sources, the ability to select and evaluate information, understanding issues of bias and misinformation, and effectiveness in disseminating information to other parties (Webber and Johnston 2000; Haenfler, Johnson, and Jones 2012). To understand the essence of digital literacy, we must first remember that an individual's ability to use certain media, being able to operate Twitter or Facebook, for example, does not demonstrate sufficient understanding of media literacy. This understanding of digital literacy is not only limited to superficial knowledge about 'how to create an account', 'creating a fanpage', or 'how to upload product photos on the online marketplace', but more than that, all enterprise owners are required to be able to understand, analyze, evaluate, and create

messages and content on media (Eshet-alkalai 2004). Digital literacy refers to holistic abilities that cover a complex set of cognitive, motor, sociological, and emotional abilities and are inherently multimodal (Eshet-alkalai and Chajut 2009; Bhatt, Roock, and Adams 2015). Therefore, the high level of internet penetration and the use of social media in Indonesia cannot be interpreted simply as evidence that Indonesian people also have a deep understanding of this new media (APJII 2018). The majority of young people show that they often overestimate their personal ability to understand digital media, including thinking that understanding the use of software is the main point in digital literacy (Eshet-alkalai 2004; Johnson, Edmundson-bird, and Keegan 2015).

Essentially digital iteration is the ability to master ideas, not buttons. More specifically, digital literacy is a series of abilities to understanding the method of accessing digital information, evaluating and processing information through various digital technology equipment, and being able to construct knowledge from various information which in the end can be used to encourage user empowerment (Christ and Potter 1998; Livingstone and Graaf 2010; Iqbal et al. 2014). In this research, the model will be used to conduct a digital literacy analysis of users based on the Coiro, Knobel,

Lankshear, and Leu (2008) and Livingstone (2004) models, which states that there has been a shift in the concept of literacy, which starts from ownership of competencies to access, evaluate and understand print static text leading to the ability to be able to access, discover, evaluate, and using digital text available on the internet. The framework is based on Coiro, Knobel, Lankshear, and Leu's media literacy model, as explained below. The framework in the table below will later be used as a tool to dissect how small and medium business owners' understanding of digital literacy in the culinary sector influences the development of their businesses.

Table 1: Digital Literacy Practices

Table 1: Digital Literacy Practices	
Types of Digital Literacy Practices	**Observed Digital Literacy Practices**
Access In general, access encompasses the ability of individuals to connect and join the media landscape. Access sees how users can change or adapt themselves so that the connection process can continue.	Use media features (smartphones, laptops, PCs) to open the internet, use Google or this search engine, use hyperlinks, access videos, sounds and other forms of multimedia content,
Analysis Analytical skills include the various competencies needed to create the structure, content,	Using keywords, interpreting symbolic meanings, searching for information and certain facts, getting
design, shape, and stages of various messages that appear in the media through a variety of perspectives.	information based on various multimedia elements, understanding the main ideas of a website, understanding inter-textual links, comparing and assessing the services of one website with another
Evaluation Evaluative ability is the final process to complete analytical skills as well as an ability to make judgments about the quality or value of media content.	Evaluating the authenticity, novelty, reliability, and credibility of the message based on the creator and the purpose of the message, understanding news or information biases, understanding how visual codes (color, framing, angles, etc.) construct meaning
Content Creation The ability to create messages in the media can be interpreted as a series of competencies related to the ability to create messages and share the messages with other parties.	Create various forms of text in various forms (text, sound, video) with the application available, edit the text that has been made, combine various forms of text according to the purpose of the text, upload text

Digital Literacy, Innovation, and MSMES

Digital literacy is an important element that must be mastered considering the digital media landscape has created opportunities as well as challenges that must be understood by all its users, especially in the economic

and business context. Several previous studies have focused on the relationship between the ability of information and communication technology (ICT) adaptation with MSMES business performance (Johnson, Edmundson-bird, and Keegan 2015; Rahayu and Day 2015; Mehrtens, Cragg, and Mills 2001; Hashim 2007; Hamdani and Maulani 2018). Some research that has been done shows that MSMES in developing countries have some more or less uniform obstacles, especially regarding the adoption and understanding of the use of ICT (Mutula and Van Brakel 2007; Hashim 2007; Rahayu and Day 2015). Other obstacles faced by MSMES include the lack of knowledge and education of business owners about business strategies, lack of managerial skills, and the inability to adapt to the development of communication technology (Mutula and Van Brakel 2007). This pattern is consistently found in many Asian countries, even in countries with the highest levels of internet infrastructure development such as China and India.

The internet itself plays a vital role in the modern development of MSMES. The Internet provides an effective strategy for small organizations to market their products, improve communication flow, launch new products, gather information, and identify potential business partners (Akkeren and Cavaye 1999). One of the main strengths of the internet is the ability of the internet to open up greater opportunities for MSMES to innovate. Innovation is an essential characteristic of entrepreneurship, which can be interpreted as the main core of the MSMES process. Innovation is related to the ability of business people to find opportunities to make profits and generate new business ideas to combine various resources to become a product, service, technology, administrative techniques, organizational design forms, and strategies new that can be maximized in business processes (Peris-Ortiz 2014; Najib and Kiminami 2011). Innovation is directly related to the attitude of being active, and taking risks (Peris-Ortiz 2014). The ability of business entities to continue the innovation process is an indisputable part given the rapid market changes presenting the challenges of competition and endless consumer demands. Large-scale companies have long paid special attention to the element of innovation, both in the context of developing products, services, and managerial systems. However in the context of small businesses, there are several unique factors that affect the development of innovation. Small businesses put more emphasis on the close cooperation process and the process of deep involvement in innovation development (Peris-ortiz 2014).

The presence of the internet also provides an extraordinary opportunity for MSMES to innovate, especially in the field of food. This research will focus on the level of digital literacy that is owned by small and medium businesses in the culinary field of innovation in products, services, and work systems and marketing they do.

SME in Indonesia.

MSMES holds a vital position in the Indonesian economy. Like many other developing countries in Asia, SME act as an engine of economic growth and development, the backbone of the national economy, the largest provider of employment, and a very important tool for alleviating poverty (Tambunan 2009). All of these characteristics are easily identified, especially in developing Southeast Asian countries such as Indonesia, Malaysia, Thailand, the Philippines, Brunei Darussalam, Cambodia, Vietnam, Laos, and Myanmar. Of a total of around 60 million MSMES in Indonesia, 98.75% are micro-enterprises, 1.15% are small enterprises, and 0.1% are medium enterprises (OECD 2018). The strength of the development of MSMES in Indonesia is mainly driven by the increasing entrepreneurial climate marked by Indonesia's macroeconomic conditions which have been quite conducive in recent years (OECD 2018). Of the total MSMES in Indonesia, around 22.6% are engaged in

food, restaurant, and beverage services (APF Canada 2018). The position of the food, beverage, and restaurant sector has increased sharply with the development of the Creative Economy Agency in 2015.

One important issue in the context of the development of MSMES in Indonesia is the growing development of obstacles faced by businesses. The majority of MSMES actors state that the main obstacles they face are financial problems, but various other problems also constrain the development of small and medium businesses such as marketing, human resources, and the ability to use certain technologies (APF Canada 2018). Although many businesses are slowly beginning to adopt ICT technology in their businesses, the majority still do not use the Internet to its full potential. Only about 1% of the total MSMES actors in Indonesia claim to have a website for business and only around 7% of business operators claim to have used the internet for online learning programs (APF Canada 2018).

The data above shows that the issue of internet use for MSMES actors in Indonesia still does not provide satisfactory conclusions. Various data explaining the high internet penetration in Indonesia along with the increasingly widespread internet infrastructure (APJII 2018) apparently cannot be simply interpreted as the high use of the internet for maximizing small and

medium enterprises (APF Canada 2018; OECD 2018). This research seeks to understand more about how businesses maximize the use of the Internet by focusing on the user's digital literacy capabilities. Through a qualitative study, it is hoped that an in-depth understanding of the level of business literacy can be found in determining the development of innovation in business processes.

Methodology

Surabaya and Malang are the two main cities in the province of East Java, the second most economically vital province in Indonesia. Surabaya and Malang occupy the top level of the number of MSMES actors in the sector of providing hotel accommodations, restaurants, and food processing (BPS Jawa Timur 2016). Based on the national census conducted by the Central Statistics Agency in 2016, 229,438 MSMES in the hotel and restaurant sector were located in the city of Surabaya while 74,794 MSMES were recorded in the city of Malang. This number is highly significant compared to some other big cities in East Java, such as Jember and Banyuwangi. As a consequence, both Malang and Surabaya provide the opportunity to conduct in-depth research on MSMES actors in the culinary field regarding their digital literacy levels and their ability to innovate business. An interview is considered the most suitable method in this study. Interviews produce deep understanding, but also still maintain the level of formality and distance between researchers and interviewees.

Thirty micro and small business owners in the culinary field participated in this research. A total of 15 enterprises owners were taken from the Surabaya area, mainly from densely populated areas in Jojoran and Ngagel, while 15 enterprise owners were taken from the Dinoyo area in Malang. All informants are chosen by random sampling by considering the definition of small and medium-sized enterprises from Indonesian Law Number 20 of 2008 concerning Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises. One of the main criteria of micro-enterprises is having assets of less than 50 million rupiahs and a maximum turnover of 300 million, while small enterprises are businesses that have assets between 50 to 500 million with a turnover of 300 million rupiahs to 2.5 billion rupiah. Culinary and small businesses are quite easily identified in Indonesia, especially in densely populated areas, where many businesses use access to the road to sell snacks and drinks of various types. The interview process was carried out within a period of approximately three months with the help of two students who had been trained previously. The results of interviews

that have been recorded are then transcribed before coding for analysis.

To simplify the data analysis process, each participant's interview results are coded according to the city where the data was collected and followed by a numeric code for the interview sequence. The 'SBY' code is for informants from the Surabaya area and the 'MLG' code is for informants from the Malang area.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The study of micro, small, and medium business owners in the culinary sector will be discussed in this section. The analysis will focus on the context of digital literacy and the ability of MSMES owners to utilize digital media to innovate. The analysis will also utilize the digital literacy capability criterion model offered by Livingstone (2008) by focusing on the user's ability to access digital media, message content analysis, message content evaluation, and the creation of independent messages that are used to support economic empowerment.

Access

In general, access encompasses the ability of individuals to connect and join the media landscape (Livingstone 2009). Access sees how users can change or adapt themselves so that the connection process can continue. This includes the ability to update and extend hardware and software applications. Not only that, but the ability to access also focuses on the ability of users to choose and use the right media, reach the expected information with this tool, and have the basic ability to understand the content. Access is the most basic ability to understand the internet. The high rate of internet penetration in Indonesia shows that at least the majority of people have mastered this ability. Based on a survey conducted by the Indonesian Internet Service Providers Association (APJII), the level of internet penetration in Indonesia has reached 54.68% of the total population (APJII 2018). The development of infrastructure that is fully supported by the government and the rapid advancement of the gadget industry has produced mass products that are relatively affordable for the Indonesian market.

The interview results show that the level of ICT adoption of MSMES actors is still minimal. Although smartphone ownership shows a fantastic increase in numbers especially in urban areas (APJII 2018), almost 60% (18 business operators) of the total respondents stated that they were "not interested" or "too busy" to try to use a smartphone to support the effort. Some businesses, especially the 40-year-old woman up with low education levels, even expressed their reluctance to get involved with anything that smells of technology,

even in the form of a fairly common as the use of machines AT M (MLG1, MLG2).

If it's too complicated I don't want to use it. The thing is, I don't have an assistant. I confess I don't really understand technology. Moreover, if it's connected to ATM Bank. I absolutely can't... (MLG1)

I have to open a bank account, which I really want to avoid. I don't want to... It's really troublesome... (MLG2)

Nevertheless, 80% (24 enterprise owners) of the total respondents stated that they were aware of the potential of the internet, especially social media as a potential business strategy. The majority mentioned the success of businesses or other businesses that utilize internet-based application services, especially food purchasing services with GrabFood and GoFood. Grab and Gojek themselves are on-demand multi-service platforms and digital payment. One of their line of service, Grabfood, and GoFood, have revolutionized the way urban Indonesian buys their food by using a two-wheeled ride-hailing driver for faster and easier food purchase. As for micro and small enterprise owners, they complain that there are many issues they do not understand about internet use. They also admit they have no self-confidence and

harbor suspicion of services on the internet. Internet services are considered as an invisible entity and therefore, cannot be controlled and observed directly. This situation is seen as disadvantages and too risky for micro and small enterprises owner who financially fragile. This suspicious and apathetic attitude based on misunderstanding is often the reason for the enterprise's owner's decision to refuse deeper access to the internet other than for informal communication. Therefore, these enterprise owners generally rely on other parties to use the internet to support their businesses, especially the younger members of their family, to make purchases of raw materials, promotions, and developing businesses. This 'younger-family-member-assistant' is usually aged between 15-23 years, is more educated, and has a better understanding of technology, especially the internet.

Actually, I can if I want to learn, but I'm lazy ... (MLG1)

We have an Instagram account, Facebook, and Whatsapp. But the one who manages all those accounts is specialized admin. Anyway, as long as there is Imam (the specialized admin name in question), there's nothing to worry about. He will

check everything. I myself don't understand about internet... (SRB 4)

Analysis

The ability to analysis is considered the most important ability in media literacy. The reason is that the main purpose of media literacy itself is to provide critical autonomy to users when using media (Livingstone and Graaf 2010). Analytical skills include the various competencies needed to create the structure, content, design, shape, and stages of various messages that appear in the media through a variety of perspectives. Users who are able to apply analytical skills will in turn understand that media messages in a variety of forms are the product of planned manipulative processes (Webber and Johnston 2000). Users are expected to be able to draw boundaries between the real world and the virtual world formed by the media.

The majority of enterprise owners appear to have experienced difficulties in understanding the landscape of Internet services. Most enterprise owners state that the services offered by the internet are too difficult to understand, so their usage patterns so far are only limited to sending messages through social media, especially through the Whatsapp and Facebook applications. However, many enterprise owners claim to have used internet services to find information that supports businesses, especially for product development and innovation (MLG4, MLG5, SBY 1, SBY 2, SBY 3, SBY 5). All business actors interviewed realized the importance of innovation, by linking with the increasingly high business competition, especially in the food sector. Some enterprise owners even say that business ideas, including the purchase of new ingredients, new forms of packaging, and new promotion strategies are obtained from the Internet.

I haven't tried it yet. Only occasionally from YouTube, I try recipes that are displayed there (SBY1).

The recipe is indeed from mother. But his inspiration from social media. The point is playing on toppings and flavors ... When trying something original, millennial kids get bored quickly. Finally, I looked for something unique. Why don't we try something else. (SBY2)

What is quite an interesting finding is the rising suspicion and doubt from enterprise owners about internet safety for religious reasons. Eight business operators stated that internet-based services, especially applications that use non-cash transactions such as OVO (popular digital payment service implemented by Grab) and GoPay

(digital payment service implemented by GoJek), are not in accordance with Islamic teachings because they are considered to contain elements of usury, manipulation, or fraud. The issue of usury in modern financial transactions, including non-sharia banking services as well as electronic sale and purchase transactions, has become one of the controversial issues in Indonesian society which is predominantly Muslim. This view arises mainly from culinary entrepreneurs who have ages between 40-55 years old, men, who come from areas that are the basis of Muslim power such as Aceh and Kebumen, and run family-based culinary businesses.

At first, I used the Gojek application. At first, I was interested but I was anti-banking. It's a usury, you know? Too complicated for me because the numbers and money sometimes don't match. I'm not ready for that. I prefer cash (SBY 3).

I once got an offer from Grab. But I did not register. I was chosen. So I was told to fill out forms. I didn't fill it in, don't understand. But already registered it. So if Go-Pay, Ovo doesn't put me up. I don't believe the system... (SBY 5)

Understandably, the problem of education is a major factor in the lack of user analysis skills in Indonesia. Besides that, the

socio-cultural background of Indonesian society, one of which is the revival of Islamic practices in the upper middle class (Heryanto 2014), also gives its own color to the pattern of enterprise owner analysis that is done by business actors. This is characterized by suspicion, and to some degree rejection, in the offer of services offered by the internet. The reason is because of the perceived service referred to is not in accordance with religious beliefs. In addition, the majority of enterprise owners interviewed appear to have been able to understand digital media in the realm of access. Some enterprise owners can't understand the features of Internet services for supporting business, especially how to utilize digital media to support innovation and develop business knowledge.

Analytical skills are the stages that users must understand after accessing the internet. The ability of users in Indonesia to conduct analysis is still limited, especially for micro-enterprises that have limited access to Internet services . This is indicated by the lack of user understanding of the content creation process in the media, understanding of application service architecture, understanding of content design and form, and various other issues. Referring to the high number of social media users, the majority of internet use in Indonesia is still limited to communicative

and entertainment functions. These two functions do not require deep critical skills and competencies so the use of new media is superficial. Users should be able to read the 'big framework' of new media to be able to utilize all the services they have to support the entire life process (Eshet-alkalai 2004; Webber and Johnston 2000; Livingstone 2009). This includes the ability to understand the ins and outs of the content production flow, who is involved in making messages, and to map regulations regarding the flow of data and global information, especially with the presence of big data and cloud computing. Analytical skills require critical thinking skills that are supported by a variety of perspectives ranging from artistic, literary, social, political, religious, and economic (Eshet-alkalai 2004; Livingstone 2009).

Evaluation

Evaluative ability is the final process to complete analytical skills as well as an ability to make judgments about the quality or value of media content. In the evaluation process, being able to see the potential effects that might result from a message or media content is also an important element (Eshet-alkalai 2004; Livingstone 2009). In essence, in the evaluation process, the user is expected to be able to connect certain media messages with his personal experience and then make an assessment of the reality and quality of the media message.

There are seven business actors (14%) based on interviews showing sufficient evaluation ability in using digital media for business innovation development (SBY2, SBY 3, SBY11, MLG4 , MLG9, MG13, MLG14). The ability to perform evaluation skills is demonstrated by the ability of enterprise owner to assess the quality of services, assess the effect of certain services on business performance, determine the level of reliability of messages that appear in various forms of online communication, and evaluate various media content that can be utilized to support businesses. All of the seven enterprises owner are at the young age (20-28 years), having a minimum education level of bachelor graduate, and opening a culinary business independently (not obtained from a bigger business or family branch).

The Internet is undeniably important. Like YouTube and Instagram. But sometimes we don't know which is real and which is not. People can just lie on the internet... I used to be a barista too. It is important we have real experience. Later we combine our internet findings and real experience. The ratio is between 70:30 (MLG 4)

There are several factors that determine the readiness of businesses to be critical of various content and services on the internet. This readiness depends very much on the set of capabilities that citizens have, the level of literacy, and the positive attitude shown in the process of adopting ICT (Mutula and Van Brakel 2007). Evaluative ability itself emphasizes a deeper understanding of various media content. This is important because the amount of information contained in new media continues to grow and exceeds the user's ability to consume. Therefore, the ability to be able to select and evaluate media content is a must-have. Evaluative ability is a set of competencies to be able to choose and assess the quality, reality, and validity of information that appears in new media. This includes the ability of users to avoid dangerous and irresponsible media content and to evaluate the objectivity of information in an environment filled with marketing messages such as advertisements.

MSMES enterprise owners who are still young, educated, and including tech savvies tend to have much higher evaluative abilities than older business actors. This more evaluative ability then gives confidence and courage to young business entrepreneurs to use internet services. Various issues that are feared by older MSMES actors can easily understood by young entrepreneurs who are able to evaluate the risks and challenges that arise on the internet.

Message Creation

The ability to create messages in the media can be interpreted as a series of competencies related to the ability to create media messages and share the message with other parties (Livingstone and Graaf 2010; Eshet-alkalai 2004). This capability is vital because it transforms users as consumers into creators and distributors of messages. The ability to create messages is the final element in media literacy because good media message creation requires a complex understanding of connections and platform selection (access), the ability to analyze the structure and dimensions of media messages (analysis), and the ability to select and evaluate the quality and reality of content (evaluate).

From the results of interviews conducted with enterprise owners, only six informants (20%) were judged to have been able to create messages on the internet to support business innovation. The message appears in the form of a variety of promotional content such as social media campaigns both independently managed or using other party assistance. The ability of enterprise owners is extremely vital in composing marketing messages and

promotional content on the internet, given that financial issues are considered to be one of the main problems faced by enterprise owners.

We play with words. Philosophically, we meant to 'be there' for our customers. So all our efforts are based on customers. We also have the hashtag #ourstoryhere. So the story with words performs like a catalyst on Instagram. We focus on the atmosphere of the story because our identity is essentially telling stories. We also create content like collages, and stories about our customers. So indirectly we can be close to consumers... (SBY5)

Based on interviews, one interesting finding is that there is a considerable distance between some enterprise owners and others in the context of creating business messages on the Internet. Young entrepreneurs between the ages of 20-28 years, such as the owner of Katalo Kopi (SBY5) and Paradise (MLG4) are able to create neat and planned message strategies. Both of them discussed the power of social media which can be used as a promotional medium that is quite effective, easy, and relatively inexpensive. However, this view is very different from 23 (76,7%) of other enterprise owners who state that social media tends to be difficult to exploit and

tends to make a contrasting distinction between offline and online business strategies. This view is most evident in family-based MSMES, carried down through generations with traditional Indonesian food such as soto, pecel, and Aceh fried noodles.

Actually, I do not really care. I don't even know my Instagram feed. I will upload a private photo on my personal (Instagram) account. When it comes to uploading Soto (the menu he sells) ... it doesn't seem necessary. I am also not interested. Maybe only one time ... (MLG3)

Message creation is an element of media literacy that is most easily associated with the business world. All understanding of the media ultimately boils down to an integrated strategic communication plan. However, the creation of good strategic communication is a big challenge that is still difficult, even for large-scale enterprises.

CONCLUSION

The results of interviews conducted on culinary MSMES owners in Malang and Surabaya reflect the lack of digital literacy skills of the Indonesian people. Although almost all informants stated that the internet did offer broader opportunities to develop business, only a few met digital literacy

criteria. The still low level of digital literacy in these MSMES actors affects their ability to adopt the internet as a tool to support business operations, not only in the context of product and service marketing but also in self-development. The majority of new enterprise owners reach the access phase, which is the initial phase where users are connected to the internet and utilize the most basic features of application services. Enterprise owners only use internet technology for informal communication purposes and access to entertainment. Only a few business actors can move towards the analysis phase, namely the ability to be able to compare the strengths and weaknesses of one service with another and take advantage of most of the features provided by the service. In addition to the lack of education, one of the most visible points of the interview is the religious issue, related to the controversy of usury and fraud from modern banking and digital payment systems. This issue creates suspicion and doubt for many micro and small enterprise owners on the internet.

A higher level of digital literacy is seen in younger enterprise owners. MSMES actors with an age range of 20-28 years tend to have a more comprehensive understanding of the internet and have even demonstrated the ability to be at the highest literacy level by creating multimedia content

independently. The MSMES enterprise owners generally started their businesses based on personal initiative instead of continuing the family business so that they are freer to determine managerial decisions, one of which is to innovate with the help of internet media. The rapid development of culinary business in Indonesia also seems to be driven by the growing involvement of young entrepreneurs who use internet technology to offer new and innovative menus.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abdul, Mohani, Hashanah Ismail, Mazlina Mustapha, and Hadri Kusuma. 2013. "Indonesian Small Medium Enterprises (SMEs) and Perceptions on Halal Food Certification." *African Journal of Business Management* 7 (16): 1492–1500. https://doi.org/10.5897/AJBM11.2926.

Akkeren, Jeanette Van, and Angele L.M. Cavaye. 1999. "Factors Affecting Entry-Level Internet Technology Adoption by Small Business In Australia : An Empirical Study." In *Proceeding 10th Australasian Conference on Information System*, 1071–83.

APF Canada. 2018. "2018 Survey of Entrepreneurs and MSMES in Indonesia." https://apfcanada-msme.ca/sites/default/files/2018-10/2018 Survey of Entrepreneurs and MSMEs in Indonesia_0.pdf.

APJII. 2018. "Penetrasi & Profil Perilaku Pengguna Internet Indonesia." https://apjii.or.id/survei2018s.

Bhatt, Ibrar, Roberto De Roock, and Jonathon Adams. 2015. "Diving Deep into Digital Literacy : Emerging Methods for Research." *Language and Education* 29 (6): 477–92. https://doi.org/10.1080/09500782.2015.1041972.

BPS Jawa Timur. 2016. "East Java MSMES Census 2016 Report." Surabaya. http://diskopukm.jatimprov.go.id/public/uploads/1571371602_Data UMKM Se 2016 dan SUTAS 2018 PLUS TK.pdf.

Christ, William G, and W James Potter. 1998. "Media Literacy , Media Education , and the Academy." *Journal of Communcation* 48 (1): 5–15. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1460-2466.1998.tb02733.x.

Eshet-alkalai, Yoram. 2004. "Digital Literacy : A Conceptual Framework for Survival Skills in the Digital Era." *Journal of Educational Multimedia and Hypermedia* 13 (1): 93–106. https://www.learntechlib.org/p/4793/.

Eshet-alkalai, Yoram, and Eran Chajut. 2009. "Changes Over Time in Digital Literacy." *Cyberpsychology and Behaviour* 12 (6). https://doi.org/10.1089/cpb.2008.0264.

Gilster, Paul. 1997. *Digital Literacy*. New York: John Wiliey & Sons Inc.

Grunert, Klaus Gunther, Hanne Hartvig Larsen, Tage Koeg Madsen, and Allan Baadsgaard. 1996. *Market Orientation in Food and Agriculture*. Boston: Kluwer.

Haenfler, Ross, Brett Johnson, and Ellis Jones. 2012. "Lifestyle Movements : Exploring the Intersection of Lifestyle and Social Movements," 1–20.

Hamdani, Nizar Alam, and Galih Abdul Fatah Maulani. 2018. "The Influence of E-WOM on Purchase Intentions in Local Culinary Business Sector." *International Journal of Engineering & Technology* 7: 246–50.

Handayani, Indah. 2018. "Tren Industri Kuliner Makin Meningkat." Beritasatu.Com. 2018. https://www.beritasatu.com/gaya-hidup/510453/tren-industri-kuliner-makin-meningkat.

Hashim, Junaidah. 2007. "Information Communication Technology (ICT) Adoption Among SME Owners in Malaysia." *International Journal of Business and Information* 2 (2): 221–40.

Hasna, S., & Irwansyah, I. (2019). Electronic Word of Mouth Sebagai Strategi Public Relation Di Era Digital. *Interaksi: Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi*, *8*(1), 18-27.

Heryanto, Ariel. 2014. *Identity and Pleasure : The Politics of Indonesian Screen Culture*. Kyoto: Kyoto University Press.

Iqbal, Javed, Glenn Hardaker, Aishah Ahmad Sabki, and Ibrahim Elbeltagi. 2014. "The Face of Digital Literacy for Muslim Teenage Girls: A Comparative Study of Bradford Muslim Girl Schools." *International Journal of Inclusive Education* 18 (12): 1283–1303. https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2014.895430.

Ismail, Verni Y. 2014. "The Comparison of Entrepreneurial Competency in Woman Micro- , Small- , and Medium-Scale Entrepreneurs." *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 115 (Iicies 2013): 175–87. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.02.426.

Johnson, Robin, David Edmundson-bird, and Brendan Keegan. 2015. "Marketing Courses Digital Literacy : Digital Maturity or Digital Bravery ?" *Enhancing Learning in the Social Sciences* 4 (2): 1–15. https://doi.org/10.11120/elss.2012.04020002.

Livingstone, Sonia. 2009. "What Is Media Literacy ?" *Intermedia* 32 (3): 18–20. http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/1027/.

Livingstone, Sonia, and Shenja V A N D E R Graaf. 2010. "Media Literacy." *The International Ecyclopedia of Communication*. John Wiliey & Sons, Ltd. https://doi.org/10.1002/9781405186407.wbiecm039.

Mehrtens, Jenni, Paul B Cragg, and Annette M Mills. 2001. "A Model of Internet Adoption by SMEs." *Information & Management* 39: 165–76.

Meyers, Eric M, Ingrid Erickson, and Ruth V Small. 2013. "Digital Literacy and Informal Learning Environments : An Introduction." *Learning, Media and Technology* 38 (4): 355–67. https://doi.org/10.1080/17439884.2013.783597.

Mutula, Stephen M., and P. Van Brakel. 2007. "ICT Skills Readiness for the Emerging Global Digital Economy among Small Businesses in Developing Countries Case Study of Botswana." *Library Hi Tech* 25 (2): 231–45. https://doi.org/10.1108/073788307107549 92.

Najib, Mukhamad, and Akira Kiminami. 2011. "Competitiveness of Indonesian Small and Medium Food Processing Industry : Does the Location Matter ?" *International Journal of Business and Management* 6 (9): 57–67. https://doi.org/10.5539/ijbm.v6n9p57.

OECD. 2018. *SME and Entrepreneurship Policy in Indonesia 2018*. Paris. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1787/207 80990.

Osterman, Mark D. 2012. "Digital Literacy : Definition , Theoretical Framework , and Competencies." In *Proceedings of the 11th Annual College of Education & GSN Research Conference*, edited by M.S. Plakhotnik, S.M. Nielsen, and D.M. Pane, 135–41. Miami: Florida International University. http://education.fiu.edu/research_conferen ce/.

Peris-ortiz, Jean-michel Sahut Marta. 2014. "Small Business , Innovation , and Entrepreneurship." *Small Business Economics* 42: 663–68. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11187-013-9521- 9.

Rahayu, Rita, and John Day. 2015. "Determinant Factors of E-Commerce Adoption by SMEs in Developing Country : Evidence from Indonesia." *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 195: 142–50. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.06.4 23.

Spires, Hiller A., Casey Medlock Paul, and Shea N. Kerkhoff. 2017. "Digital Literacy for the 21st Century." In *Encyclopedia of Information Science and Technology, Fourth Edition*, edited by Mehdi Khosrow-Pour, 4th ed. Hershey: IGI Global. https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1- 5225-7659-4.ch002.

Tambunan, Tulus. 2009. "Women Entrepreneurship in Asian Developing Countries : Their Development and Main Constraints." *Journal of Development and Agricultural Economics* 1 (2): 27–40. http://www.academicjournals.org/JDAE ©.

Trihendrawan, Nuriwan. 2019. "Sektor Kuliner Indonesia Tumbuh 12,7%." Cnbcindonesia.Com. 2019. https://ekbis.sindonews.com/read/1388028 /34/sektor-kuliner-indonesia-tumbuh-127- 1552972400.

Webber, Sheila, and Bill Johnston. 2000. "Conceptions of Information Literacy : New Perspectives and Implications." *Journal of Information Science* 26 (6): 381–97.

Williams, Peter. 2015. "Exploring the Challenges of Developing Digital Literacy in the Context of Special Educational Needs Communities." *Innovation in Teaching and Learning in Information and Computer Sciences* 15 (1): 1–16. https://doi.org/10.11120/ital.2006.050100 06.